



Bardstown Road/Baxter Avenue Corridor Review Overlay District

Report of the Bardstown Road Baxter Avenue Overlay Committee

Case No: 17BROD1013
Classification: Non-Expedited

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 1050 Bardstown Road
Louisville, KY 40204

Applicant: Charles J. Williams
Charlie Williams Design Inc.
1628 Windsor Place
Louisville, KY 40204
502-459-1810
charliewilliamsdesign@gmail.com

Owner: Greenlite LLC
1503 Sylvan Court
Louisville, KY 40205
502-296-3315
sallyclemons@yahoo.com

Estimated Project Cost: \$140,000

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval for the demolition of the existing building located at 1050 Bardstown Road. The applicant proposes to build in its place a new 2-story wood framed residential structure. The new construction will be 2x6 frame with 4" exposure smooth vinyl siding and vinyl 1/1 double hung and awning windows. The building's roof will have weathered wood shingles. A two-story porch with decorative railing is along the primary façade facing Bardstown Road. The structure will be 3'-0" off each side of adjacent property lines. A fence will surround the property and be of 1x6 treated wood, stained black, with a height of 72".

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on September 29, 2017. The application was determined to be complete and classified as requiring Non Expedited Review on October 2, 2017. The proposed project is scheduled for a hearing and review at a meeting of the Bardstown Road Overlay Committee on October 24, 2017 with notices mailed not less than 10 days before the meeting to the applicant and abutting property owners.

Presentation & Discussion

The Bardstown Road Review Overlay Committee Hearing met at 12:00pm on October 24, 2017 in Room 302 of the Metro Development Center. Staff member Burcum Keeton and Urban Design Administrator David Marchal were in attendance. Committee members in attendance were: John Warmack (Chair), Ken Baker, Roberto Bajandas, Kathy Carey, and Lynne Lyndrup. The applicant Charlie Williams was present.

The staff report was presented by Burcum Keeton, followed by the applicant's project description. Mr. Williams explained that improving the building's foundation was too costly for the property owner and due to the building's poor structural condition they were pursuing demolition of the building. The proximity of the building to the adjacent buildings was also a concern, as it did not allow access between the properties for maintenance or repair.

The Committee discussed the proposed project and expressed concern over the design. Committee members were in agreement that the proposal did not sufficiently complement the character of the Bardstown Corridor in both massing and design. Mr. Warmack stated that the existing building on the site had more character than what was proposed. Committee members agreed. Mr. Warmack pointed out that the front porch design did not comply with the intent of the Guidelines. Mr. Bajandas stated that although the original building was a residential structure, the new building's design was uncharacteristic of the Corridor and lacked residential detailing. The Committee discussed the porch and roof line, and agreed that the façade was too simplistic in design. The Committee encouraged Mr. Williams to redesign the façade, with emphasis on a more refined roof form and design details.

Public Testimony

Highlands resident Debra Harlan was not in favor of the proposed design.

Committee Decision

After receiving staff report, applicant comments, public testimony, and discussion, the Committee proceeded with recommendations for approval. Mr. Bajandas made a motion to recommend deferment of action based upon the conclusion of the Committee that the replacement structure proposed does not provide equal or superior design quality to the original existing structure. Mr. Baker seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design guidelines, approved for the Bardstown Road/Baxter Avenue Corridor Review Overlay District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Building Design** and **Site Planning and Parking**. The report of Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site context / Background

The property is zoned C2 and is located within the Traditional Marketplace Corridor. The two-story wood frame structure was built in 1900 and has a later one-story addition at the rear. 1050 Bardstown Road surrounded by similarly designed one and two story

buildings and residential homes converted to commercial buildings with small front yard setbacks. The members of Greenlite, LLC currently own the properties and operate the businesses located at 1052, 1056 and 1058 Bardstown Road. The commercial storefront facing Bardstown Road has been altered and currently has a front porch that has been enclosed with glazing. The building has been vacant since 2015. Per Cynthia Johnson, Metro Historic Preservation Officer, 1050 Bardstown Road has been identified as not being eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places, and therefore is not considered a Contributing Historic Structure in terms of the Overlay Guidelines.

CONCLUSIONS

The property owner Greenlite, LLC recently purchased 1050 Bardstown Road in its current condition with the intent to improve the building's condition. The applicant's findings show that structural issues may make the rehabilitation of the building ineffective as well as cost prohibitive. As the property owners of the adjacent 3 properties to 1050 Bardstown Road, Greenlite LLC has shown their commitment to preserving the District's commercial character, and encouraging a pedestrian friendly environment. Based on the information submitted to Staff by the applicant, Staff concludes that the project as proposed is complementary in design and materials to the buildings along the Corridor and meets the intent of the Bardstown Road Baxter Avenue Overlay Guidelines.

Decisions

Considering the information furnished and the conclusions from the Committee's meeting, the Bardstown Road Overlay District Committee finds that the proposal does not fully comply with the Design Guidelines of the Overlay and therefore **defers action** of the application for an Overlay Permit until further information as requested below are submitted.

1. The applicant shall submit a revised design with
 - a. more careful material selection on the front façade
 - b. a revised front porch and roof gable design.
2. The applicant shall submit a revised design of either
 - a. a contemporary infill design, or
 - b. a traditional design using elements of the existing façade without replication.

11/30/17

Date


Mr. John Warmack
Committee Chair

Building Design

+ Meets Design Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Design Guidelines
Information

NA Not Applicable
NSI Not Sufficient

SPECIFICATIONS	DESIGN REVIEW GUIDELINES	REVIEW RESULTS
1. Existing Structures	Existing structures along the Bardstown Road / Baxter Avenue corridor are encouraged to be renovated and reused.	- Building proposed to be demolished
2. Pedestrian -Friendly	Design building façade elements that promote pedestrian – friendly environment include; building to the edge of sidewalk, large storefront window openings at the ground floor, awnings, canopies, and lighting.	+ Building has double height porch along front façade, promoting pedestrian interactivity
3. Storefront Windows	All storefront windows and doors at ground level shall have clear glass or light window tinting. Severe window tinting or mirrored glass is not permitted unless pre-approved by staff for 'special conditions'. Examples of 'special conditions' may include restaurant kitchen areas, storage space, and restrooms that would need to be hidden from public view.	NA
4. Building Setback	New structures should be located at the front of the property line. Building sites should provide side yards wide enough to allow for maintenance of the building unless common party walls are provided on the lot line.	+/- Building is 3'-0" from side property line. Building is recessed from front property line to line up with setbacks of neighboring buildings
5. Building Materials	High quality materials and historically appropriate architectural details at the ground floor / street level of buildings can both accent buildings , and provide visual interest for pedestrians and motorists.	+ 4" exposure smooth vinyl siding and vinyl 1/1 double hung and awning windows. The building's roof will have weathered wood shingles. A two story porch with decorative railing is along the primary façade facing Bardstown Road.
6. Building Height	New structures greater than three stories high may be permissible if taller portions are set back from the street frontage so that overall sight lines are compatible, and if increased height is not intrusive towards adjacent structures.	NA; 2 story
7. Building Façade Details	A terminus, such as a cornice at the top of a wall helps articulate the architecture, and gives it a completed finished look.	+
8. Roofs	Roof forms that are inconsistent with the character of the Bardstown Road / Baxter Avenue Corridor include: single pitch (shed) roofs, curving roofs. Flat roof forms with parapets are well-suited to the character and image of the Bardstown Road / Baxter Avenue Corridor.	+

9. Outdoor Eating Areas	Outdoor eating or temporary seating located within public sidewalk areas must receive staff approval prior to installation. A 4'-0" wide pedestrian zone is required in the public "Right of Way" sidewalk area.	NA
10. Mechanical Equipment	All new mechanical equipment that is visible from a public right of way should be installed to have a minimal impact on adjacent properties and from public view. Replacement of existing mechanical equipment is considered general maintenance and will not require a staff review. Additional permits and approvals by other government agencies or authorities may be required.	NA
11. Permanent Service Counters	Permanent service counters, service bars, decks, or similar structures may not be constructed in front of a building's primary street facing façade.	NA

Site Planning, Parking

- + Meets Design Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Design Guidelines Information

NA Not Applicable
NSI Not Sufficient

SPECIFICATIONS	DESIGN REVIEW GUIDELINES	REVIEW RESULTS
1. Utility Lines	Development Plans shall minimize the adverse visual impact of utility lines on the corridor. Underground lines or service from the alley, where feasible, is encouraged.	NA
2. Lot usage	Combining existing small, under-utilized lots to create shared parking areas that are more efficient and more accessible is strongly encouraged.	NA Existing parking lot to remain
3. Parking areas and Drive Thru's	Parking areas and Drive-Thru's should be located to the side or rear of the structures.	+ Existing parking lot at rear to remain
4. Parking Areas	Parking areas adjacent to the public sidewalks must use landscaping, trees, colonnades or other construction to maintain the building line created by structures along the sidewalk. Side parking lots which exceed 40% of the total linear lot frontage adjacent to right-of-way shall provide a 36" high masonry, stone, or concrete wall that makes reference to a similar design within the surrounding area extending from the principal structure across the front of the parking area. Surface parking lots with no principle structure shall provide the 36" wall as described. The 36" tall wall can wrap around any existing or proposed monument signage to maintain visibility.	NA Surface lot is existing, and at rear of property
5. Perimeter Landscaping	Adequate perimeter landscaping, fencing, or a combination of both is required to help screen parked vehicles from full public view. The screening height shall be 36" above finished grade of the parking lot. This height will enable drivers of vehicles to safely see and avoid pedestrians and vehicles while screening most of the parked vehicles mass.	NA
6. Residential Screening	New development projects should provide adequate significant screening to residential structures.	NA, commercial properties surrounding proposed project
7. Lighting	Intensity, location, color, and direction of outdoor lighting shall be sensitive to nearby residential areas.	NA
8. Fencing	Fencing and screening shall be constructed of materials compatible with the principal structure.	+ 72" tall wood fence proposed
9. Chain Link Fencing	Chain link fencing must not be visible from Bardstown Road/Baxter Avenue.	NA
10. Curb-cuts	The number and width of curb-cuts on the corridor should be minimized to promote pedestrian circulation. Existing continuous curb-cuts should be reduced to widths necessary for vehicular traffic.	NA
11. Patios, Plazas, and Outdoor Spaces	Patios, plazas, or outdoor spaces, constructed, created, or installed in front of a structure that replaces existing turf and / or landscaped areas, shall use permeable pavers, pervious concrete, or equivalent permeable hard surface to reduce water runoff from the property.	NA
12. Landscaped Buffer Area	Minimum 4'-0" wide landscape buffer area (LBA) containing a 36" minimum height (at maturity) screen shall run along 90% of the lineal area in front of the patio, plaza, or outdoor space that faces the street. This landscape buffer area (LBA) shall include permanent landscaping material such as trees (minimum 1 3/4" caliper size at time of	NA

	planting). Shrubs (minimum 18' height at time of planting), groundcover, and / or perennials. Fences, planters, and / or walls (maximum height of 36") are permitted within the LBA. Landscape Buffer Plantings shall be installed prior to occupancy or use of the patio, plaza, or outdoor space.	
--	--	--

13. Existing Trees Preserved and Replaced	Existing trees located within the property or adjacent property along the street, alley, or access easement shall be preserved and protected unless the city arborist determines they are not healthy or are a dangerous and should be removed. Removed trees should be replaced with appropriate trees approved by the City Arborist. The replacement trees shall be sized at a minimum of 1 ¾" caliper 9at time of planting. Replacement tree(s) shall be planted within 3 months of the tree(s) removal or during the next planting season, which ever comes first.	+
14. Decks in Front of Buildings and Balconies	The construction or installation of a deck or structure built off the ground and over existing landscaped areas in front of a building's primary façade is prohibited. Balconies located on the second or third floor of a buildings that are cantilevered or bracketed, scaled to match the building's façade, and utilize contextual materials are appropriate.	+/- Building has double height front porch. Building is a residential structure and porch/balcony is for residents' use only