



---

## Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

---

# Report to the Committee

---

To: Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee  
Thru: Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Officer  
From: Bradley Fister, Senior Planner – Urban Design  
Date: May 23, 2025

---

**Case No:** 25-COA-0057  
**Classification:** Committee Review

### GENERAL INFORMATION

**Property Address:** 1412 Willow Ave. Units 21, 22, 32, 34, 35, 37, & common areas  
1416 Willow Ave. Units 2A, 2B, 3A, 3B, & common areas

**Applicant:** James Hopkins, President of  
Dartmouth-Willow Terrace HOA  
1416 Willow Ave., Unit 6B  
Louisville KY, 40204  
(415) 420-6942  
[jimhopkins@gmail.com](mailto:jimhopkins@gmail.com)  
[dwtboardpresident@gmail.com](mailto:dwtboardpresident@gmail.com)

**Owner:** Please see attached list of individual owners, unit numbers,  
and contact information

**Estimated Project Cost:** TBD

### Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant requests approval to replace a total of 205 historic wood double-hung and casement style windows and wrap their trim located on all elevations of both the Willow Terrace building and the Dartmouth building. There is currently a mix of muntin configurations ranging from 1/1, 3/1, 4/1, 6/1, 8/1, and 8/8 double-hung windows as well as a few 16-lite casement windows. The proposed replacement windows will be Andersen E-series clad wood double-hung windows.

#### 1412 Willow Avenue (Willow Terrace):

- Unit 21/22 – eight (two 4/1, six 6/1) all non-street facing
- Unit 32 – eight (two 4/1, six 6/1) all non-street facing

- Unit 34 – seventeen (two 4/1, six 6/1, two 6/6, one 8/1, six 8-lite casement windows) all street facing
- Unit 35 – fourteen (two 4/1, two 4/4, seven 6/1, one 8/1, one 8/8) ten non-street facing
- Unit 37 – six (five 6/1, one 4/1) one non-street facing

**1416 Willow Avenue (Dartmouth):**

- Unit 2A – twenty-three (five 1/1, two 4/1, fifteen 6/1, one 8/1) fifteen non-street facing
- Unit 2B – twenty-three (five 1/1, two 4/1, fifteen 6/1, one 8/1) nine non-street facing
- Unit 3A – twenty-three (five 1/1, two 4/1, fifteen 6/1, one 8/1) fifteen non-street facing
- Unit 3B – twenty-three (five 1/1, two 4/1, fifteen 6/1, one 8/1) nine non-street facing

**Public Spaces on floors three and below of 1412 and 1416 Willow Avenue:**

- Sixty (two full-lite, seven 3/1, two 4/1, forty-nine 6/1) twenty-three non-street facing

*\*This proposal is only for the windows on the third-floor and below. The windows on the fourth floor and above of both buildings were approved previously under case number 25-COA-0058.*

**Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application**

The application was received on March 5, 2025 and was determined to be complete and requiring committee level review.

The case is scheduled to be heard by the Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on Wednesday May 28, 2025 at 4:30 PM in Room 101 of the Metro Development Center located at 444 S. 5<sup>th</sup> Street.

**FINDINGS**

**Guidelines**

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Window**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

**Site Context/ Background**

The Willow Terrace (8 stories tall), located at 1412 Willow Avenue, was constructed in 1922. The Dartmouth (11 stories tall), located at 1416 Willow Avenue, was constructed in 1927. Both buildings were designed by local architecture firm Jospheh and Joseph in the Beaux Arts style popular in Louisville from the late 1880's through the late 1920's. Each include character defining features such as symmetrical facades, raised stone foundations, classical bas-

reliefs of medallions and garlands, heavy cornices, and low-slope roofs with ornate parapets. They are zoned R8A and are located on the west side of Willow Avenue in the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The site is surrounded by other multi-story apartment buildings of varying architectural styles.

Previous COAs for the Willow Terrace (1412 Willow Ave.) include case #21-COA-0013 in February of 2021 for tree removal.

Previous COAs for the Dartmouth (1416 Willow Ave.) include:

- Staff approved 25-COA-0058 in March 2025 for the replacement of all windows in both buildings on floors four and above;
- Staff approved 21-COA-0194 for installation of updated step rails, and an ornamental gate and fence panels;
- ARC approved 19-COA-1144 for window replacement;
- ARC approved 18-COA-1219 for window replacement; and
- ARC approved 16-COA-1199 for after-the-fact window replacement.

## **Conclusions**

The proposed window replacement somewhat meets the standard design guidelines for **Window**. All windows proposed for replacement are on the basement, first, second, and third levels of the two multi-story, multi-family, historic residential buildings. The guidelines call for the evaluation and review of all street-facing windows on levels three and below. For this reason, staff has inspected each of the windows proposed for replacement to evaluate their level of deterioration.

Staff determined the majority of the windows do not meet the standard for deterioration, thus not meeting **W.1** and **W.4**. However, large multi-family buildings such as these have different constraints from other buildings in the District. With the number of windows in the buildings, the visual rhythm of all the windows together is more consistent and impactful as its own design element. This is different from smaller scale buildings where a single window may be more impactful. For these reasons, the National Park Service (NPS) and Kentucky Heritage Council (KHC) take a more holistic review approach on large multi-story buildings such as these. The applicants are pursuing historic rehabilitation tax credits for the window replacement, which will be reviewed in depth by NPS and KHC. In this instance, staff believes a holistic approach is appropriate and should meet the guidelines. Each individual window is not character defining. It is the design of the whole façade of windows that is truly character defining.

The proposed wrapping of the trim generally does not meet **W.2**. However, the wood trim that is simple in design and its proposed wrapping can prevent further deterioration and possible deferred maintenance issues. The applicants have unique height related constraints to access the windows and trim readily and affordably on a regular basis to consistently maintain them. Though these are residential buildings, their scale and massing are not comparable to single-family residences or smaller multi-residential buildings in the District.

The proposed replacement windows do generally meet **W.4**. They will be Andersen E-series, clad wood, double-hung windows with clear glazing that will match the muntin configuration of the existing windows and fit the historic window openings. This window type will be used on the entire building for a cohesive design. There is one owner requesting replacement of their three 16-lite, double casement windows with 8/8 double-hung windows. The casement windows are generally considered a hazard at this height. Historically, this change has already occurred in some of the units and has not negatively impacted the historic integrity of the building (**Figures 1 and 2**). While this proposed change in design and function does not fully meet **W.4**, staff believes there is historic precedent and site-specific needs to approve this change.

Given the specifics of these sites and buildings and the recommendations by NPS and KHC, staff recommends approval of the replacement of all windows contained in this application.

Furthermore, if the ARC approves this application, staff requests that additional, identical applications for replacement of street facing windows and wrapping of trim, that are submitted for 1412 and 1416 Willow Avenue only, may be reviewed and approved at a staff level given they meet the same specifications of the windows approved under this application.



Figure 1 – U of L Libraries Digital Collections Photograph of Willow Terrace Apartments, 1927.





Figure 2 – Google Street View, Oct 2018, of 1412 Willow Ave. (red squares indicates a 16-lite casement window previously replaced with a 16-lite double-hung window).

### RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved** with the following conditions:

1. The applicant shall submit a glazing sample to staff for review and approval prior to ordering the replacement windows.
2. All replacement windows shall be the proposed Andersen-E series double-hung windows with clear or neutral low-E glazing.
3. Necessary repairs shall be made to wood prior to wrapping. No rotten wood shall be wrapped.
4. If the proposal or scope of work should change in any way the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval prior to continuing work.

Bradley Fister

Bradley Fister  
Senior Planner – Urban Design

5-23-2025

Date

# Window

## Standard Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
<b>W.1</b>	<p>Preserve the functional and decorative features of a historic window, as well as the historic window material on street-facing and street-address building features (bays, etc.) and facades as they are more character defining. For structures that were constructed with four or more stories, this applies to the first three stories.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Where a historic window is intact and in repairable condition, retain and repair it to match the existing as per location, lite configuration, detail, and material.</li> <li>Preserve the historic window features including the frame, sash, muntin, mullion, glazing, sill, head, jamb, and molding.</li> <li>Preserve a historic transom. A transom can be opened to let cool air in and warm air out of the structure.</li> <li>Preserve the original material of a window. If this is not possible, alternative materials may be considered if they convey the character, detail, and finish of the original material.</li> <li>Maintain the functionality of a historic double-hung window in a historic structure. A double-hung window functions like a transom, and allows cool and in and warm air out, facilitating air circulation.</li> <li>Repair, rather than replace, a frame and sash.</li> <li>Consider weather-stripping a window to reduce air flow in and out of a structure, creating a more energy-efficient building.</li> </ul>	+/-	<p>The majority of the windows proposed for replacement do not meet the standard for deterioration, thus their proposed replacement does not meet this guideline. However, large multi-family buildings such as these have different constraints from other buildings in the District. With the number of windows in the buildings, the visual rhythm of all the windows together is more consistent and impactful as its own design element. This is different from smaller scale buildings where a single window may be more impactful.</p> <p>For these reasons, the National Park Service (NPS) and Kentucky Heritage Council (KHC) take a more holistic review approach on large multi-story buildings such as these. The applicants are pursuing historic rehabilitation tax credits for the window replacement, which will be reviewed in depth by NPS and KHC.</p> <p>In this instance, staff believes a holistic approach is appropriate and should meet the guidelines. Each individual window is not character defining. It is the design of the whole façade of windows that is truly character defining.</p>
<b>W.2</b>	<p>Avoid alterations to a historic window that would negatively affect the historic appearance of the window and structure.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass on street-facing and street-address facades.</li> <li>Do not use smoked, tinted, or reflective glass on street-facing and street-address facades. Neutral appearance low-E is permissible.</li> <li>Do not remove, block in, or back-paint a transom or sidelight. If this has been done previously and changes are proposed, then it will be corrected to come into compliance with these guidelines.</li> <li>Do not alter the number, size, location, or shape of a historic window on street-facing and street-address building features and facades by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings.</li> <li>For a masonry structure, inset new bricks in historic window or door openings on secondary or tertiary elevations that have approval to be removed. Preserve opening details, such as lintels, to</li> </ul>	+/-	<p>The applicant proposes to replace the windows using clad-wood, Andersen E-series, double-hung windows that will fit in the historic openings without modifications. All glazing shall be clear, neutral low-E is permissible with staff review of a glazing sample prior to ordering.</p> <p>Furthermore, the proposed wrapping of the trim generally does not meet W.2. However, the wood trim that is simple in design and its proposed wrapping can prevent further deterioration and possible deferred maintenance issues. The applicants have unique height related constraints to access the windows and trim</p>

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	<p>demark where the historic opening was once located.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Do not locate any new window openings that may be required for a new use on street-facing and street-address facades.</li> <li>Do not remove or obscure historic window trim with metal or siding materials on street-facing and street-address building facades. If this has been done previously and changes are proposed, then it will be corrected to come into compliance with these guidelines.</li> <li>Do not install new floors, dropped ceilings, or interior walls that block the glazed area of historic windows. A design should incorporate a setback that allows the full height of the historic window to be seen unobstructed if new floors, dropped ceilings, or interior walls are necessary.</li> </ul>		<p>readily and affordably on a regular basis to consistently maintain them. Though these are residential buildings, their scale and massing are not comparable to single-family residences or smaller multi-residential buildings in the District.</p> <p>See conditions of approval.</p>
<b>W.3</b>	<p>Reconstruct a missing window element.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Use a surviving prototype to reconstruct a missing window element, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and exterior shutters or blinds.</li> <li>Use a material for which there is a historic precedent or a compatible substitute material if necessary.</li> </ul>	NA	
<b>W.4</b>	<p>Match a replacement window design to the historic. Replace a severely deteriorated historic window on street-facing and street-address building features (bays, etc.) and facades with a new window that conveys the same visual appearance. For structures that were constructed with four or more stories, this applies to the first three stories.</p> <p>For more information on what classifies a window as “severely deteriorated” and, therefore eligible to be completely replaced, see the final page of this chapter.</p> <p>Windows on side and rear elevations that are not character defining and do not face the street, do not have to meet the severely deteriorated threshold. For structures that were constructed with four or more stories, windows on the fourth story and higher do not have to meet the severely deteriorated threshold.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Use historical, pictorial, and physical documentation to select a new window that is compatible with the historic character of the building.</li> <li>Select a window that matches the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features when the repair of historic windows is impossible.</li> <li>Install a replacement window that operates in the same way as the original window. Double-hung windows are replaced with double-hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements. Replacement windows can also appear to operate in the same way. A casement or fixed window that looks like a double-hung window could be permissible.</li> <li>Do not install a replacement sash that does not fit historic window openings. Historic openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate a stock window.</li> <li>Do not install a synthetic replacement window on street-facing and street-address building features</li> </ul>	+/-	<p>The proposed replacement windows do generally meet W.4. They will be Andersen E-series, clad wood, double-hung windows with clear glazing that will match the muntin configuration of the existing windows and fit the historic window openings. This window type will be used on the entire building for a cohesive design.</p> <p>There is one owner requesting replacement of their three 16-lite, double casement windows with 8/8 double-hung windows. The casement windows are generally considered a hazard at this height. Historically, this change has already occurred in some of the units and has not negatively impacted the historic integrity of the building (Figures 1 and 2). While this proposed change in design and function does not fully meet W.4, staff believes there is historic precedent and site-specific needs to approve this change.</p> <p>See conditions of approval.</p>

	<b>Guideline</b>	<b>Finding</b>	<b>Comment</b>
	<p>(bays, etc.) and facades that does not appear similar in size, finish, texture, and depth to the historic window materials. For structures that were constructed with four or more stories, this applies to the first three stories.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Do not replace a multi-pane window that has true divided lights with thermal glazing windows that have false "snap-in" or applied muntins on street-facing and street-address building features (bays, etc.) and facades. Simulated divided lite is permissible. For structures that were constructed with four or more stories, this applies to the first three stories.</li> <li>Do not install contemporary picture, glass block, or jalousie window in an exterior window opening unless there is historic documentation that this occurred originally. Where basement windows are not visible from the street, are severely deteriorated, and are non-functional, glass block may be permissible.</li> <li>If a window has been previously replaced that does not meet these guidelines, the next time it is replaced, it will come into compliance by following these guidelines.</li> </ul>		
<b>W.5</b>	<p>Preserve and repair an existing wood shutter when possible.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Keep historic shutters intact. The shutters serve as accents and provide security.</li> <li>Use existing shutters to help cool a structure. Shutters help block solar heat gain in the summer while allowing breeze to pass through (if they are louvered), helping with cooling costs during summer months.</li> </ul>	NA	
<b>W.6</b>	<p>Repair an existing shutter with in-kind materials or with materials that replicate the original material, design, and dimensions. If the shutter was replaced previously with a material that does not meet these guidelines and work is being done, then it will be corrected to come into compliance with these guidelines.</p>	NA	
<b>W.7</b>	<p>Replace shutters where they previously existed when possible.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>If damage is too extensive to repair, using replacement shutters may be considered.</li> <li>Choose a replacement shutter that appears similar in style, color, size, and material to the historic materials. The replacement shutter should cover one-half of the window, were it to be closed.</li> <li>Install shutters only where there is historic evidence for them.</li> <li>A replacement shutter should be or appear to be operable, measure the full height and width of the windows, and be constructed of a historically appropriate material.</li> <li>Mount replacement shutters so they partially cover the vertical trim of the window frame.</li> <li>Do not mount a shutter to the masonry or cladding on either side of the window.</li> <li>Do not install aluminum or vinyl shutters that do not accurately replicate the historic shutter.</li> </ul>	NA	
<b>W.8</b>	<p>Preserve an original awning when possible.</p>	NA	
<b>W.9</b>	<p>Maintain a historic awning in operable condition when possible.</p>	NA	
<b>W.10</b>	<p>Repair an altered awning to its original design when possible.</p>	NA	
<b>W.11</b>	<p>Replace a non-repairable historic awning or add a new</p>	NA	



	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	<p>awning to be consistent with the historic context.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Design an awning to complement existing architectural features. It should not overwhelm the facade.</li> <li>• Design an awning to be of matte-finish, weather-proofed fabric of traditional form, and of a color that complements the building. Typically, an awning of a solid color and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building is the preferred pattern.</li> <li>• Consider the use of an operable awning where appropriate. Operable awnings can provide shade in the summer and allow solar access in the winter, increasing the energy-efficiency of a structure.</li> <li>• Use a material that is durable and weather resistant.</li> <li>• Attach an awning between the window display area and the signboard or second floor window sill. An awning should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present.</li> <li>• Do not damage the historic structure when installing an awning. Hardware should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints, not masonry.</li> <li>• Do not use plastic or back lit awnings. Metal, glass, fiberglass, and similar material awnings may be permissible if they complement the architecture of the building.</li> <li>• Do not install an awning where it would not be historically appropriate.</li> </ul>		
<b>W.12</b>	<p>Minimize the visual impact of a modern appurtenance on a historic building.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Install a window fixture, such as air conditioning unit, in a window on a secondary elevation when possible.</li> <li>• Do not alter the window sash to accommodate an air-conditioning unit, if this has been done previously and changes are proposed, then it will be corrected to come into compliance with these guidelines.</li> <li>• Install a storm window that duplicates the shape and color of the historic window. A storm window can help reduce air movement into and out of an existing window and provide a more affordable way to create a more energy efficient home.</li> <li>• Use a storm window that has wood or narrow metal frame.</li> <li>• Mount a storm window on the blind stop within the window frame.</li> <li>• Install security bars in a way that does not obscure the historic window.</li> <li>• Use retractable commercial security bars for a storefront.</li> <li>• Upon installation of a modern appurtenance, do not damage any part of the historic window or frame or obscure the architectural character of the historic window.</li> </ul>	NA	